



Planning Commission Agenda Report

June 13, 2018
Item 5.a.

SUBJECT: P18-0032

APPLICANT: William Douglas

PURPOSE: Application for Conditional Use Permit to operate a private non-commercial lodge for Pleasanton Masonic Lodge

LOCATION: 1181 Quarry Lane, Suite 350

GENERAL PLAN: General and Limited Industrial

ZONING: PUD-I (Planned Unit Development - Industrial) District

EXHIBITS:

- A. [Draft Resolution and Conditions of Approval](#)
- B. [Narrative/Project Plans dated "Received April 30, 2018"](#)
- C. [Location and Notification Map](#)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Planning Commission approve Conditional Use Permit (CUP) Case No. P18-0032 based on the findings and subject to the draft conditions of approval in Exhibit A.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The applicant requests CUP approval to operate a private non-commercial lodge for Pleasanton Masonic Lodge at 1181 Quarry Lane, Suite 350, within the Valley Business Park. Private non-commercial clubs and lodges require Planning Commission review and approval of a CUP at this location. As such, the CUP application is before the Planning Commission for consideration. As proposed, staff believes this use is consistent with the objectives of the zoning district and will be compatible with the surrounding uses. Conditions of approval have been included which will ensure that the safety and general welfare of the surrounding area, and the City in general, is maintained.

BACKGROUND

Valley Business Park was approved under Ordinance No. 928 by the City Council on March 11, 1980 and modified in 2015 (PUD-80-01-15M) to conditionally permit private non-commercial clubs and lodges. The applicant is requesting approval of a CUP to operate a private non-commercial lodge for Pleasanton Masonic Lodge within an existing building at 1181 Quarry Lane, Suite 350, within the Valley Business Park. The lodge would provide a meeting place for Masonic Lodge members, as well as a meeting place for their affiliated organizations including the Doric Chapter – York Rite organization and the Pleasanton DeMolay and Job's Daughters youth organizations. The applicant formerly operated a similarly

sized private non-commercial club and lodge at 3370 Hopyard Road, but vacated that location in 2017, and seeks to relocate the lodge to the proposed location. The subject site is zoned PUD-I District. As stated above, private non-commercial lodges are conditionally permitted within the PUD-I District with the approval of a CUP. Accordingly, the CUP for this application is before the Planning Commission for consideration.

SITE AND AREA DESCRIPTION

The subject parcel is a flat and fully developed 1.38-acre parcel near the south end of Quarry Lane within Valley Business Park. There are four single-story, multi-tenant buildings constructed on the subject site. The subject building is currently leased as two tenant spaces. The applicant would occupy Suite 350, which is approximately 4,032 square feet in area. There are 100 shared parking spaces on the subject parcel. The subject parcel and building are accessible from three driveways off Quarry Lane. Figure 1 below shows an aerial photograph of the subject site and building, and shows the site in the context of Valley Business Park. Valley Business Park includes a mix of uses such as: professional offices, light manufacturing and industrial uses, religious facilities, private schools, music schools and recreational facilities. Two single-family residential developments are located approximately 760 feet to the south and 840 feet to the west of the subject site.

Figure 1: Aerial photograph of subject site



PROPOSED PROJECT

The proposed lodge would provide a meeting place for Masonic Lodge members, as well as a meeting place for their affiliated groups including the Doric Chapter – York Rite organization and the Pleasanton DeMolay and Job’s Daughters youth organizations. The private non-commercial club and lodge would generally operate during the evenings Tuesday through Thursday and be closed on Mondays, Fridays and most weekends. The proposed days and hours of operation for the lodge are described in Figure 2. Unlike the prior lodge facility on Hopyard Road, there would be no rentals of the proposed facility to other groups, organizations, or individuals. In addition, no outdoor events or activities are proposed, and no patios or similar outdoor gathering spaces are located on the subject property.

Figure 2: Days and Hours of Operation (Monthly)

Use	Mon.	Tue.	Wed.	Thur.	Fri.	Sat.	Sun.
Masonic Lodge	Closed	Closed	First Wednesday – member meeting – 630 p.m. to 10 p.m. Other Wednesdays – initiation practice or initiation – 7 p.m. to 1130 p.m.	Last Thursday – committee meeting – 7 p.m. to 930 p.m.	Closed	Closed	Closed
Doric Chapter*	Closed	Closed	Closed	Third Thursday – member meeting – 630 p.m. to 10 p.m.	Closed	Closed	Closed
Pleasanton DeMolay	Closed	First and Third Tuesdays – member meeting – 630 p.m. to 10 p.m.	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed
Job's Daughters	Closed	Second and Fourth Tuesdays – member meeting – 730 p.m. to 10 p.m.	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed	Closed

*Two to three times annually, initiation practice is held on the first Thursday of the month between 7pm to 930pm
 Note: Each group would also have an annual or semi-annual installation of officers on a Saturday between 730pm and 11 pm and three to four fundraisers would be help annually on a Saturday from 8am to 1130am

The applicant is proposing a maximum of 60 members/guests on-site at any one time for the installation of officers events; however, the majority of the time, the on-site occupancy would average between eight and 30 members/guests.

The applicant is not proposing any exterior changes to the building. The interior changes would result in a floor plan (Exhibit B) comprised of a lodge hall, a club room, a kitchen, an office, a lobby, restrooms and miscellaneous storage rooms.

Please see the attached narrative and project plans (Exhibit B) for additional information on the proposed use.

STAFF REVIEW/ANALYSIS

Conditional uses are those uses which, by their nature, require special consideration so that they may be located properly with respect to the objectives of the Municipal Code and with respect to their effects on surrounding properties. In order to achieve these purposes, the Planning Commission is empowered to approve, conditionally approve, or deny applications for CUP's.

Land Use

The subject parcel has a General Plan land use designation of General and Limited Industrial and is zoned PUD-I (Planned Unit Development – Industrial) District. Private non-commercial clubs and lodges are conditionally permitted per the PUD-80-01-15M. Accordingly, the applicant has applied for a CUP. If the CUP were granted, the proposed private non-commercial lodge would be consistent with the applicable land use regulations.

One of the primary concerns in reviewing a CUP application is the effect of a proposed use on surrounding uses. Staff believes the proposed use will be compatible with the surrounding uses. Staff carefully considered the proposed operating characteristics of the project, particularly given issues that had arisen with late-night events and other activities at the Masonic Lodge's prior location on Hopyard Road.

The applicant's proposal does not allow for rental of the facility to any outside groups, organizations, or individuals and would not rent out the kitchen. In addition, there would be no outdoor activities or events. Based on these provisions in the proposal and the planned events/attendance described in the project narrative, staff does not anticipate these past issues to carry over to the subject site. Additionally, there are no residential uses within close proximity to the subject site, with the nearest such uses at least 760 and 840 feet away to the south and west, respectively. Moreover, to be sensitive to the other tenants on the subject site and the surrounding area, and to ensure that the applicant would have minimal impact in terms of parking and circulation, the lodge's operating hours are scheduled during the week for the early to mid-evening period, and on occasional Saturdays, which would minimize overlap with the operating hours of other uses occupying the subject site.

Should future problems arise with the proposed use, the City would have the ability to bring the application back to the Planning Commission for mitigation, or possible permit revocation, if necessary. Based on the discussion above, staff believes that such an action would be unlikely. In addition, staff has included conditions of approval that will ensure the proposed use would not generate noise, traffic, or parking shortages such that surrounding uses would be adversely affected. Therefore, from a land use perspective, staff finds the proposed use to be acceptable on the site, as conditioned.

Traffic and Circulation

The Traffic Engineering Division has reviewed the project narrative and plan that was prepared for the proposed use, and has determined that the proposed hours of operation, planned events and the associated number of attendees would not have a significant impact on existing traffic levels. Additionally, the activities for the proposed use would not coincide with the AM/PM peak hour traffic levels for the other uses at the subject site and the surrounding area. However, should the applicant wish to increase the proposed attendance numbers for the planned events and/or alter the hours stated in its narrative, review by the City's Traffic Engineer would be required to assess whether a traffic study would be required and whether payment of traffic fees and implementation of other mitigation measures would be warranted.

Parking

There are 100 parking spaces available on-site. Pursuant to Section 18.88.030 (D)(1) of the Pleasanton Municipal Code (PMC), *Schedule of off-street parking space requirements*, one space is required for each six seats or one space for each 60 square feet of floor area usable for seating if seats are not fixed for private non-commercial clubs and lodges. Since the use would not have fixed seating, a maximum of 38 parking spaces would be required for the proposed use based on its square footage (1,100 sq. ft. club room + 1,191 sq. ft. lodge hall = 2,291 sq. ft. / 60 sq. ft. = 38 parking spaces). Since all other on-site uses would be closed when the proposed use intends to operate, including on weekends, 100 parking spaces would be available for the proposed use, creating a surplus of 62 parking spaces on-site. Therefore, the proposed use would be consistent with the PMC and not result in a deficit of parking.

Based on the above parking analysis and recommended conditions of approval, staff believes that the proposed use would not adversely affect parking supply at the subject site or surrounding properties and that adequate parking exists on-site to accommodate all existing and proposed uses. However, should parking problems occur, staff has included a condition of approval which allows the Director of Community Development to refer the use permit back to the Planning Commission for possible additional mitigation measures to be applied (Exhibit A). Possible mitigating conditions could include reducing the number of members/guests and/or modifying the planned events schedule to reduce conflicts with other on-site uses and parking demand.

Noise

The PMC states that a proposed conditional use must be in accordance with the objectives of the Zoning Ordinance. One of those objectives is to “promote the stability of existing land uses that conform with the General Plan and to protect them from inharmonious influences and harmful intrusions.” For the most part, staff anticipates that the proposed lodge would generate interior noise levels comparable to and no different from those of an office or light industrial use. All planned events/activities would be held indoors, with the exterior doors closed during operating hours. According to the applicant, there would be no loud amplified noise, music or speech generating noise above typical speech levels. The one exception would be the semi-annual DeMolay and Job’s Daughters installations that usually have a dance on a Saturday until 11 p.m. The dances would be held entirely indoors and utilize recorded music with adult chaperones monitoring the volume levels to ensure it is not excessive. Furthermore, the subject building does not contain any operable windows, which will further reduce noise impacts on the surrounding area. To further minimize any noise impacts, staff is recommending the following conditions of approval:

- All exterior doors must remain closed at all times during operating hours;
- Lodge members/guests shall not loiter outside of the building and shall be courteous and quiet when entering or leaving the parking area; and
- The City shall have the right to review the project again to add mitigating conditions should any future complaints regarding noise levels occur. Such conditions could include modifying the hours of operation, reducing the number of persons allowed in the tenant space, and/or requiring sound/noise attenuation to be installed within the subject tenant space.

The PMC establishes a noise limit of 75 dBA for the Industrial District. Since the proposed use would generally operate after the normal business hours (8 a.m. to 5 p.m.) of all other on-site uses, and with the inclusion of the recommended conditions above, staff has determined that it is unlikely that the noise produced by the proposed use would adversely affect existing or future adjacent/nearby uses or residences, or exceed the noise threshold.

ALTERNATIVES

As articulated above, staff believes the use, as proposed and conditioned, is consistent with the objectives of the zoning district. However, alternatives to the proposal that could be considered by the Planning Commission include:

1. Denial of the application. Such an action would preclude the applicant from occupying the subject site and conducting the specified activities; or
2. Approval of the CUP with modifications. The Planning Commission could approve the CUP, but with fewer members/guests and/or planned events, with modified hours of operation, or other changes to the proposal.

Since staff is able to support the findings to approve the project, as proposed, and believes the project will not adversely impact any existing uses or the surrounding area, staff suggests that neither of the two project alternatives above should be pursued.

SUMMARY OF PROS/CONS OF PROJECT

PROS	CONS
Allows for relocation of an existing private non-commercial club and lodge formerly/already within Pleasanton to a more suitable location based on available parking and lack of proximity to residential uses	Increases traffic, parking demand at this project site (however, circulation and parking impacts would not be adverse)
Provides meeting space to support local social and youth organizations	Creates a private non-commercial club and lodge in an area/on a site designed primarily for office and light industrial uses
Consistent with zoning regulations	

PUBLIC NOTICE AND COMMENTS

Notices of this application were sent to surrounding property owners and tenants within a 1,000-foot radius of the site. Staff has provided the location and noticing map as Exhibit C for reference. At the time this report was published, staff had not received any public comments about the project.

ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT

This project is categorically exempt (Section 15301, Class 1, Existing Facilities) from the requirements of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA). Therefore, no environmental document accompanies this report.

SUMMARY/CONCLUSION

As proposed and conditioned, staff believes that the proposed use will be compatible with and will not detrimentally affect the existing or future adjacent/nearby uses or residences. Conditions of approval have been included which will ensure that the safety and general welfare of the surrounding area, and the City in general, is maintained. Staff believes that the proposed use will fulfill a community need and that the proposed location is appropriate.

Primary Author:

Eric Luchini, Associate Planner, 925-931-5612 or eluchini@cityofpleasantonca.gov

Reviewed/Approved By:

Steve Otto, Senior Planner

Ellen Clark, Planning Manager

Gerry Beaudin, Director of Community Development