

- SUBJECT:** PDR-537/PCUP-169
- APPLICANT/PROPERTY OWNER:** Pleasanton Presbyterian Church
- PURPOSE:** Application for design review and conditional use approval to erect an approximately 6,200 square-foot stressed membrane (Sprung) structure in Phase I of the facility development for a period of up to ten years.
- GENERAL PLAN:** Retail, Highway, and Service Commercial; Business and Professional Offices.
- ZONING:** Planned Unit Development (PUD) – Public and Institutional and Mixed Public and Institutional (P&I and Mixed P&I)
- LOCATION:** 3410-3440 Ironwood Court, Busch Property (PUD-18)
- ATTACHMENTS:**
1. Location Map
  2. Exhibit A: Site Plan, Narrative, and Elevation Drawings, dated “Received, June 7, 2006”
  3. Exhibit B: Draft Conditions of Approval dated September 13, 2006
  4. Exhibit C: Conditions of Approval for PDR-377, dated October 27, 2004
  5. Exhibit D: Conditions of Approval for the Pleasanton Presbyterian Church, from City Council Ordinance No. 1866 approving PUD-18, dated August 20, 2002
  6. Exhibit E: Letter from the Pleasanton Presbyterian Church, dated May 8, 2002
  7. Exhibit F: PDR-562 Modifications, approved August 11, 2006
  8. Exhibit G: Letter of Support from Ponderosa Homes, dated June 30, 2006
  9. Exhibit H: Sprung Instant Structure Information, printed September 7, 2006 from <http://www.sprung.com/>

10. Exhibit I: Environmental Noise Assessment for the Sprung Structure, Illingworth & Rodkin, Inc., dated August 11, 2006

---

## **BACKGROUND**

The applicant, Pleasanton Presbyterian Church (PPC), submitted a design review application (PDR-537) and a conditional use permit (PCUP-169) proposing an approximately 6,200 square-foot stressed membrane (Sprung) structure during Phase I of the campus development plan. The applicant is requesting the structure be considered “temporary” for a period of up to ten years.

When the PPC approached the City with plans for expansion at 4300 Mirador Drive, the City encouraged the church to relocate due to the existing site constraints. The City helped facilitate the relocation of the PPC to the Busch Property subject site. The City Council approved the conditional use for the church facility on August 20, 2002 as part of the Planned Unit Development for Ponderosa Homes on the Busch Property (PUD-18). The development plan for the project included 193 single-family homes, a 172-unit senior apartment complex, a 23-acre potential school site, a 2.5-acre private park, and a 6-acre church site for the Pleasanton Presbyterian Church. At the time of PUD development plan review for the project, the church had not completed its full design plans for its facility. A condition of approval for PUD-18 required subsequent approval for the design, landscaping, grading, and phasing of the church campus to be submitted for the review and approval of the Planning Commission.

On October 27, 2004, the Planning Commission approved case number PDR-377, the master plan for the church complex that consists of four buildings: an approximately 24,108 square-foot sanctuary (Building A), an approximately 28,718 square-foot youth center (Building B), an approximately 20,344 square-foot children’s building (Building C), and an approximately 8,240 square-foot worship center (Building D). The buildings were to be constructed in four separate phases over an anticipated period of 20 years.

The PCC has consistently noted that it, like other churches and non-profits across the country, is entirely dependent upon giving from its members for funding construction projects, see Exhibit E. Based upon its capital giving campaigns and its estimates for future giving, the church has requested modifications to its initial development plan. On August 11, 2006, the Zoning Administrator approved minor modifications to the PPC phasing plan and modifications to the design of Building D (PDR-562). See Exhibit F for a description of approved modifications.

The approved and proposed revisions to the master plan will allow the church to expand the preschool and children’s programs, as well as meet the worship needs of its congregation, while working within the constraints of its budget and the fixed date of December 1, 2007 to vacate its current location. Design review and conditional use applications of this nature are subject to review and approval by the Planning Commission.

## **SITE DESCRIPTION**

The project site is an approximately 6.41-acre property bordered on the south by Busch Road, on the east by Ironwood Drive, on the north by Cornerstone Court and the Gardens at Ironwood senior apartment complex, on the northwest by the homes currently under construction in the Ironwood Classics subdivision on Nolan and Madsen Courts, and on the west by the Ironhorse Trail (being improved by Ponderosa Homes). The subject property is relatively flat and is currently undeveloped. Ingress to the site will be provided through a driveway off of Cornerstone Court and egress will be provided off of the Cornerstone Court driveway as well as a driveway off of Busch Road. Emergency Vehicle Access (EVA) will be located at the western end of the PPC parking lot through to Madsen Court's cul-de-sac.

## **PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

The applicant is requesting design review and conditional use approval to erect an approximately 6,200 square-foot, stressed membrane (Sprung) structure. The PPC is requesting to use the structure for a period of up to ten years or until construction of the permanent building, whichever comes first. It is the intent of PCC to build the permanent building (Building B) much sooner than ten years, if charitable giving allows.

The Sprung structure, which is proposed to be "Bayberry," a mossy green color (see photo below), would be located at the corner of Valley and Busch Roads at the future site of Building B. Sprung structures are reusable, engineered stress membrane structures. They are constructed of extruded aluminum arches connected to an outer, all-weather, certified flame retardant, architectural membrane. The aluminum substructure has an indefinite life expectancy, with a company offered 30-year pro-rata guarantee. The architectural membranes have pro-rata guarantees of up to 20 years. For more information regarding Sprung structures, please refer to Exhibit H.



**Proposed Bayberry Colored Sprung Membrane**

The functions and use of the Sprung structure would be similar to those originally outlined for Building B in the church's master plan: various multi-purpose ministries and activities.

## **ANALYSIS**

In order for PCC to conduct its full range of planned community ministries on the site within its financial capacity, and for it to be able to occupy the site within the time frame defined in the sales agreement for the Mirador property, the church is seeking conditional use approval to erect a Sprung structure during the first phase of development (for a maximum of ten years) along with the traditionally constructed buildings. This use permit request is solely for the approval of the temporary Sprung structure; it does not alter or otherwise amend the church's use permit for its operations that was approved by the City Council as part of PUD-18.

### **Proposed Term and Uses**

The church would use the Sprung structure for various multi-purpose ministries and activities during the ten year period. Since the uses are the same as what was proposed as part of the master plan, no additional traffic impacts are likely to exist. The conditional use approval would allow the Sprung structure to remain until construction of Building B, or ten years, whichever is first.

### **Structure Description**

The 6,200 square-foot Sprung structure will have a maximum height of 26 feet. The applicant is proposing the membrane to be "Bayberry," (please see photo on the previous page). Landscaping around the Sprung structure will allow it to blend into the surroundings. Particular attention has been given to the line of sight through the EVA for Ironwood residents immediately adjacent to the church's property; the structure is oriented to minimize the surface area facing the single-family homes. Ponderosa Homes, the developer of the Ironwood residences, has reviewed the applicant's plans for the Sprung structure. Ponderosa Homes believes the PPC campus is an integral part of the Ironwood Community and is fully supportive of this project. Please refer to Exhibit G for letter of support from Ponderosa Homes.

### **Green Building**

Commercial structures of less than 20,000 gross square feet or more of conditioned space are not subject to the City's Green Building Ordinance (P.M.C. §17.50.030(K)(2)). However, the original approval for the church facility (PDR-377) required a LEED certified rating for all buildings in the complex, to which the Sprung structure must comply before issuance of a building permit. The Sprung structure should easily comply with green building in that the aluminum substructure is reusable and, according to Sprung Instant Structures, Inc., almost always experience multiple life cycles as they are passed on from

owner to owner. The aluminum substructure is 100% recyclable and the architectural membranes used in Sprung structures have a life span of up to 30 years, thereby decreasing replacement times and the related energy consumption from manufacturing. All fiberglass insulation in a Sprung structure is composed of 55% recycled post-consumer glass. In addition, an acrylic resin is substituted in the manufacturing process to ensure no phenol formaldehyde or ammonia emissions are created. For additional information on Sprung structures, please see Exhibit H.

### **Noise**

Ponderosa Homes commissioned a noise assessment for the Sprung structure that was conducted by Illingworth & Rodkin, Inc. (Exhibit I). The report summarizes that, “[T]he sound of amplified music during regular evenings or Sunday mornings may be, at most, barely audible outside on the adjacent properties, and would be approximately equal to or below ambient noise levels. During special events that may occur up to four evenings per year, the amplified music could be played at sound levels up to 10 dBA higher, and would be audible outside and slightly above ambient levels. Sound levels would be well below the City of Pleasanton Noise Ordinance. The sound of amplified music is not expected to cause any significant disturbance to or adverse community response from occupants of the nearest residences and senior housing.” In order to mitigate noise from activities conducted within the Sprung structure, two conditions have been added. One requires that the sound system is oriented towards the southeast and therefore away from the Ironwood and senior residences. The other condition requires that the doors of the Sprung structure remain closed at all times during times of activity. Illingworth & Rodkin, Inc. state that no additional mitigation measures are recommended.

### **Landscaping**

The subject site is part of the Busch Property for which a tree report was prepared as part of the approval for PUD-18. As conditioned, the subject project is subject to all recommendations of the tree reports dated May 27, 2002 and updated in April 1996. The PPC’s master development plan proposes site landscaping. In order to ensure adequate screening of the structure from the Valley and Busch intersection, staff has conditioned the project to require additional planting along the street frontage.

### **PUBLIC NOTICE**

On Wednesday June 28, 2006, the applicant held a “coffee hour” at the Gardens Ironwood senior community center. Members of the church presented the proposed modifications to residents of the senior center. The latter expressed enthusiasm over the proposed project.

Staff sent notices of the Planning Commission’s public hearing on this item to all property owners, tenants and residents located within 1,000-feet of the subject property on September 1, 2006. As of the writing of this report, staff has received no public comment.

## **FINDINGS**

The Planning Commission needs to make the following findings prior to the granting of approval for the Sprung structure.

### **Conditional Use Permit Findings**

- 1. The location of the proposed conditional use is in accordance with the objectives of the zoning ordinance and the purpose of the district in which the site is located.***

The subject site is located in the Public and Institutional and Mixed Public and Institutional (P&I and Mixed P&I) portion of a Planned Unit Development. Public and Institution Districts are intended to provide sites for public or institutional uses, including religious facilities. The conditional use permit approving the activities of the church was approved as part of PUD-18. The temporary Sprung structure will house the same activities as previously approved until the permanent building is constructed. This finding can therefore be made.

- 2. The proposed location of the conditional use and the conditions under which the conditional uses would be operated or maintained will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or materially injurious to the properties or improvements in the vicinity.***

The Sprung structure will be required to meet all standards and regulations of the California Uniform Building and Fire Codes before it can be erected. This finding can therefore be made.

- 3. The proposed conditional use will comply with each of the applicable provisions of Chapter 18.124 of the Pleasanton Municipal Code.***

Chapter 18.124 of the Municipal Code states that, because of their unusual characteristics, conditional uses require special consideration so that they may be located properly with respect to their effects on surrounding properties. The proposed Sprung structure is a temporary measure to meet the immediate needs of the Pleasanton Presbyterian Church. As previously stated, the uses proposed within the Sprung structure are the same as those proposed and approved for the future permanent building. The temporary structure will thereby create no increased impacts to the surrounding properties. This finding can therefore be made.

## **Design Review Findings**

### ***1. Preservation of the natural beauty of the city and the project site's relationship to it;***

The proposed structure will be erected for a temporary length of time. The applicant selected Bayberry as the membrane's color to harmoniously blend with the surrounding campus and landscaping. The natural beauty of the City and the project site's relationship to it will therefore be preserved.

### ***2. Appropriate relationship of the proposed building to its site, including transition with streetscape, public views of the buildings, and scale of buildings within its site and adjoining buildings;***

Landscaping around the Sprung structure will allow it to blend into the surroundings. Particular attention has been given to the line of sight through the EVA for Ironwood residents immediately adjacent to the church's property; the structure is oriented to minimize the surface area facing the single-family homes. At 26 feet in height the structure is in scale with the other buildings on the church campus. The landscaping surrounding the structure will provide a smooth transition with the streetscape, not impacting public views of the buildings.

### ***3. Appropriate relationship of the proposed building and its site to adjoining areas, including compatibility of architectural styles, harmony in adjoining buildings, attractive landscape transitions, and consistency with neighborhood character;***

The proposed Sprung structure is compatible with the adjoining buildings on the church campus and the proposed landscaping provides an attractive transition that is consistent with the neighborhood character.

### ***4. Preservation of views enjoyed by residents, workers within the City, and passersby through the community;***

Surrounding landscaping will effectively screen the structure and preserve the views enjoyed by residents, workers within the City, and passersby through the community.

### ***5. Landscaping designed to enhance architectural features, strengthen vistas, provide shade, and conform to established streetscape;***

The landscaping proposed as part of this project is strategically sited to screen and soften views of the Sprung structure. Additionally, the proposed landscaping will provide shade and conform to the established streetscape.

### ***6. Relationship of exterior lighting to its surroundings and to the building and adjoining landscape;***

No lighting is proposed with this project.

### ***7. Architectural style, as a function of its quality of design and relationship to its surroundings; the relationship of building components to one another/the building's col-***

*ors and materials; and the design attention given to mechanical equipment or other utility hardware on roof, ground or buildings;*

The architectural style, although not consistent with the architectural style of the other permanent church buildings, is compatible with the church campus and the function of the design and relationship to the surroundings.

***8. Integration of signs as part of the architectural concept; and***

No signage is being proposed with this project.

***9. Architectural concept of miscellaneous structures, street furniture, public art in relationship to the site and landscape. (Ord. 1612 § 2, 1993; Ord. 1591 § 2, 1993)***

No miscellaneous structures, street furniture, public art is being proposed with this project.

## **ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT**

This project was included in the scope of the mitigated negative declaration prepared and adopted in September 2002, for the PUD rezoning and development plan review for the Busch Property (PUD-18). Therefore, no further environmental assessment is required.

## **CONCLUSION**

Staff acknowledges the effort the church has made in working with the City to relocate to the subject site after recognizing that it had “out grown” the Mirador Drive site. Staff believes that the modifications proposed by the church are both a practical and functional means to fulfill the goals of the Pleasanton Presbyterian Church and the community it serves. The colors and proposed landscaping around the Sprung structure, will help blend the structure in with the surroundings. Staff commends the PCC for their innovative planning to meet the needs of the City and its congregation.

## **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission:

1. Make the required use permit findings for PCUP-169 and design review findings for PDR-537 in the staff report; and
2. Approve cases PDR-537 and PCUP-167, subject to the conditions of approval listed in Exhibit B.

*Staff Planner: Leslie Mendez, (925) 931-5611, lmendez@ci.pleasanton.ca.us*