



Planning Commission Staff Report

October 11, 2006
Item 6.c.

- SUBJECT:** PUD-93-02-08M/PCUP-181
- APPLICANT:** Mike Callahan
- PROPERTY OWNER:** Wente Bros.
- PROPOSAL:** Application for a major modification to the Ruby Hill PUD development plan to allow the construction of an approximately 19,872-square-foot event center with a 4,800-square-foot winery, and for a conditional use permit to allow the operation of the event center and winery and for alcoholic beverage service at the event center after 10:00 p.m.
- GENERAL PLAN:** Agriculture and Grazing and Urban Growth Boundary Line.
- ZONING:** PUD (Planned Unit Development) – A/OS/LDR (Agriculture/Open Space/Low Density Residential) District.
- LOCATION:** Southwest corner of Vineyard and Isabel Avenues, south of Ruby Hill Drive.
- ATTACHMENTS:**
1. Exhibit A: Site Plan, Floor Plans, Building Elevations, Green Building Council's LEED Scorecard dated "Received September 13, 2006"
 2. Exhibit B: Proposed Conditions of Approval
 3. Exhibit C: Tri-Valley Conservancy Letter
 4. Exhibit D: South Livermore Valley Area Plan
 5. Exhibit E: Ruby Hill Homeowners Association Meeting Minutes of June 1, 2006
 6. Exhibit F: Neighborhood Meeting of July 24, 2006, Meeting Notes, and Comments Regarding the Original Proposal
 7. Exhibit G: Neighborhood Meeting of August 2, 2006, and Comments Regarding the Current Proposal
 8. Exhibit H: Comments from City of Livermore

9. Exhibit I: Negative Declaration
 10. Location Map
-

BACKGROUND

The subject site is located within the Ruby Hill Planned Unit Development (PUD-93-02). The overall development was originally approved by the Alameda County before it was annexed to the City of Pleasanton. Development of the site is subject to the County's planned development conditions of approval and the Ruby Hill Development Agreement. Development must also be consistent with the South Livermore Valley Area Plan policies and the Conservancy Easement with the South Livermore Valley Agricultural Land Trust/Tri-Valley Conservancy.

Existing uses on the site are planted grapes, a single-family residence, and agricultural buildings. Permitted uses for this property include vineyards, vineyard maintenance facilities, irrigation detention ponds, and other functions ancillary to wine production. Other uses including a winery, an event center would require the submittal of an application for a PUD major modification. Further, the conservation easement limits the amount of land not in grape production to a maximum of 3.9 acres.

Mr. Michael Callahan has requested a manor modification of the Ruby Hill development plan to allow the event center and winery. Major modifications are subject to review by the Planning Commission and by the City Council.

SITE DESCRIPTION

The subject site is a relative flat site at the southeast corner of Vineyard Avenue and Isabel Avenue (State Route 84). It is approximately 55.2 acres in size, a vineyard property, planted by Signature Properties with Ruby Hill development and operated by Wentz Brothers. Access to the site is provided by an access driveway from Vineyard Avenue to the east gate of the Ruby Hill Development. This driveway was formerly used by Ruby Hill construction traffic and was retained by the property owner for use by farming vehicles. An existing house and three accessory buildings are located near the southwest portion of the site.

Surrounding uses are listed as the following:

| | |
|--------|-------------------------------------|
| North: | Gravel Quarries (Alameda County) |
| East: | Commercial (City of Livermore) |
| South: | Vineyards and Ruby Hill Development |
| West: | Vineyards and Ruby Hill Development |

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The applicant proposes to modify the approved Ruby Hill Development plan to allow an event center and winery and to allow the following activities as part of the development plan of the site:

1. Construction of an approximately 19,716-square-foot event center with an approximately 4,800-square-foot winery;
2. Use the existing single-family residence as the caretaker unit for the vineyard;
3. Use the existing farm/accessory buildings as a tasting room, barrel room/production and equipment storage.

The new constructions, i.e. the event center and the winery, would be located near the southeast corner of Vineyard Avenue and Isabel Avenue. It is designed to architecturally compliment the existing Palm Event Center located on the west side of the Ruby Hill Development entrance gate and the new commercial building on the east side of Isabel Avenue (Livermore). It would use similar materials and features as seen on the Palm Event building and the winery building at the Mitchel Katz Winery. The walls would be predominately stucco walls with stone used as an accent element.

The entrance is the focal point of the building. The wooden door is placed in the center of the entrance with two wall lamps on either side. The upper portion of the entrance has three windows with an arch on top, and accent tiles on the sides, between and below the window. A faux roof breaks the massing of the building, and this roofline continues across the front elevation and is the roof for the gallery.

The gallery connects that Event Center to the winery which would also have stuccoed pillars with decorative wrought iron. The inner courtyard connects the dining room with the winery and is featured with a fountain, pillars with decorative metal grill, lawn areas and various shrubs.

Access to the facility would be from Vineyard Avenue via the existing farm road. A deceleration lane and a left-turn pocket, paid by the applicant, would be constructed for access into the site from both east-bound and west-bound Vineyard Avenue, respectively. A two-way driveway to the facility would be aligned with the building's entrance and that it has vineyards on both sides. This driveway would be lined up with decorative columns with bougainvillea draping down from the top.

The driveway and the vineyards form a half circle. The applicant would provide a total of 132 parking spaces. They would be located on the sides of the building and along the half circle on

the outer side of the vineyards. Valet parking is proposed, and the parking attendants would park the guests' cars in the parking areas to facilitate on-site circulation. Based on the experience from the Palm Event Center, the applicant believes that the proposed parking area would be sufficient for most of the events.

ANALYSIS

General Plan and Land Use

The subject site is designated by the Land Use Element of the Pleasanton General Plan for Agriculture and Grazing uses. The site is adjacent to the Vineyard Avenue Corridor Specific Plan area, and the General Plan for this area encourages uses which relate to the outlying wine country and calls for creating a attractive gateway to the Livermore Valley wine country and implementing wine country architectural and landscape design themes throughout the corridor. The Vineyard Avenue Specific Plan contains similar land use objectives to encourage development of vineyard and related commercial uses.

The proposed development would retain the existing accessory buildings for vineyard uses. While the proposed event center and winery is not currently a permitted use in the PUD, the applicant has proposed that it be allowed so as to provide a facility for weddings, parties, and similar functions as people enjoy the vineyard setting. These facilities are often located in the wine-growing regions and as such would promote local economy and would attract tourism. This is consistent with one of the policies of the South Livermore Valley Area Plan, adopted by Alameda County in 1993, which encourages the promotion of the area as a premier wine-producing center by encouraging appropriate tourist attractions and supporting uses such as the proposed event center and winery. By classifying the event center and winery as a conditional use, the City would have control over the operational aspects of the use, ensuring that potential issues such as noise, parking, and traffic can be controlled.

South Livermore Valley Agricultural Land Trust/Tri-Valley Conservancy

The subject site is covered by an agricultural conservation easement granted to the South Livermore Valley Agricultural Land Trust (SLVALT). This proposal was reviewed and supported by SLVALT representatives and by representatives of the Tri-Valley Conservancy (TVC). The conservation easement benefiting SLVALT limits the non-vineyard use to a total of 3.9-acres of building envelope area. This area includes the existing residence, the three accessory buildings, the proposed event center and winery, the driveway, and the parking area surrounding the proposed event center and winery. TVC/SLVALT representatives have requested that the applicant amend the conservation easement to clearly describe both building envelopes (existing and the proposed) and the building envelopes should be physically demarcated from the vineyard

areas. As conditioned, the applicant would amend the easement by preparing and recording a metes and bounds description of the building envelopes, and would then stake the areas with brass property corners/hubs in the field.

Fees

Ruby Hill development, including the subject site, is not part of the Vineyard Avenue Corridor Specific Plan area. By prior development agreement, the proposed development is not subject to the Citywide and area wide traffic mitigation fees. Except for sewage fees, which would be paid to the City of Livermore, the applicant would be required to pay all other required City fees for this development. A condition of approval has addressed this issue.

Site Design

The proposed location is a result of two Ruby Hill HOA meetings. The original proposal showed a cluster design where the event center would form a campus environment with the existing residence and the accessory buildings. The proposal was rejected by nearby residents due to concerns of noise, lighting, and parking.

The proposed location shows the event center and winery located near the intersection of Vineyard Avenue and Isabel Avenue, which would be furthest away from the residential uses. This site selection not only responds to the neighbors' concerns, it also corresponds to the new commercial building on the opposite corner of Vineyard and Isabel in Livermore.

Staff and the applicant have paid careful attention to the location of the building with respects to Route 84 Expressway Widening Project (Isabel Avenue) that the City of Livermore is sponsoring as well as the views towards Vineyard Avenue/Isabel Avenue. In discussion of the proposed location with URS Corp., project consultant for the City of Livermore, the proposed building location would not be affected by the Route 84 Expressway Widening Project as the building print does not encroach further beyond the existing Piemonte Drive. Once the roadwork is complete, the view of the event center and the winery from both Vineyard Avenue and Isabel Avenue would be striking – motorists would see vineyards wrap around the building, a driveway lined with trees and decorative columns provide a direct access to the fountain plaza, then to the main entrance of the facility. In the far corner of the site are the original residence and the barn building nesting among matured oak trees.

Parking and Circulation

The Parking Ordinance does not have a specific parking ratio for an event center; however, for facilities such as auditoriums, community centers, etc, it requires one parking space for each six

(6) seats or one space for each sixty (60) square feet of floor area usable for seating if sets are not fixed. The dining room at the Event Center is approximately 9,200 square feet in floor area; thus, it would require a total of 153 parking spaces ($9,200/60=153$). As proposed, a total of 132 parking spaces would be provided, which is 21 spaces short of what is required.

As previously mentioned, since the operation of the proposed event center and winery would be very similar to that of the Palm Event Center and that based on the experience from the Palm Event Center, the applicant believes that the on-site parking would be adequate to handle the events.

The driveway to the facility and the parking area would have a decomposed granite surface. It would not only allow water to percolate through to meet the storm water management requirements, it also allow the driveway and the parking area be compacted to support emergency vehicles. In addition, handicap spaces would be provided to meeting the requirement of ADA.

The majority of the parking area is located between the proposed facility and streets. The intent is to use the building to screen the parking area; thus, to mitigate the noise and dust generated from arriving and departing vehicles, and/or from conversations carried in the parking areas. There is a small number of parking spaces that would be located on the sides of the building. The existing vineyards between the proposed facility and the residential properties should provide an adequate buffer to mitigate the noise and lighting.

Traffic

Similar to the operation of the Palm Event Center, traffic to and from the proposed event center would occur primarily at off-peak hours during mid-weekdays and weekend hours. Staff did not consider a traffic report to be necessary for this proposal for the following reasons:

- Beets Fine Catering, operator of the Palm Event Center, would be operator of the proposed event center and winery. The operation would follow the same schedule as that for the Palm Event Center:

Weekdays: from 10:00 a.m. to 3:30 p.m. and from 7:30 p.m. to 11:00 p.m.
Weekends: from 2:00 p.m. to 11:00 p.m.
- To facilitate efficient site access for westbound traffic on Vineyard, staff recommends that the applicant install a left-turn pocket on Vineyard Avenue. The applicant would pay for the entire amount of the left-turn pocket, and complete the construction prior to commencement of the event center and winery. A condition of approval has addressed this

issue. In addition, staff has added a condition enabling the City to require temporary traffic control personnel for large events, when needed, paid for by the applicant, to supervise and control left-turning vehicles going to/from the site.

Given that Beets Fine Catering is to operate the proposed event center and winery, staff has added a condition requiring staggered event schedules in order to reduce traffic congestion when there are events held at both the existing and the proposed facilities.

Noise

As conditioned, all events taking place at the event center and winery must conclude operation by 11:00 p.m. Between 11:00 p.m. and 12:00 midnight, guests would be leaving and the event center staff/caterers would be cleaning the building.

Staff understands that the noise from outdoor events is a concern of the Ruby Hill residents. For this reason, there is a general prohibition for outdoor music events/performances taking place in the courtyard or any other outdoor area at the facility. Staff, however, believes that weddings and similar events should be allowed to take place outdoor such as in the courtyard area. Staff believes it to reasonable to request that acoustic-only music /voice accompaniment, e.g. acoustic guitar or piano, would be appropriate. Staff also believes that at such functions, it would be appropriate to include a string quartet. Outdoor ceremonies would then be allowed to take place no later than 9:00 p.m. The proposed restrictions and the distance from the facility to the residential sites should mitigate any of the perceived negative impacts Ruby Hills residents.

Acoustical and amplified music instruments, or a DJ are proposed for indoor events. Staff believes that the noise concerns could be mitigated through various methods. The proposed building is a concrete tilt-up building. The thickness of the wall would provide sufficient noise attenuation. The building design does not show any operable windows on the rear elevation facing the residential sites. In addition, a condition is added requiring windows and doors remain closed, but not locked, during those event times.

Some of the residents were concerned about the noise from wine production. Mr. Callahan indicated that the equipment used in the production area is very quiet. He would not have any equipment located on the south side of the existing farm buildings. Staff added a condition that a copy of the equipment's specification needs to be submitted. If the noise level of the equipment exceeds the maximum as allowed by the Pleasanton Municipal Code, the applicant is required to mitigate the issue.

Building Design

The proposed architecture is inspired by the Mediterranean, or Spanish, colonial style. It shows the traditional pattern of an inner courtyard, heavy iron window grills, a gallery resting on massive pillars. Mission style, light clay tile roof would be used. The wall surfaces would be stucco with Eldorado field ledger stones covering the entrances to both the event center and the winery. The stucco finish would be smooth.

Window details include the window trim and black iron grills. Window niches shown at the upper portion of the buildings would have a trim and spandrel glass. The purposes of the window niches are to add interest to the building elevation and to prevent noise and light from impacting adjacent residents. The pillars at the gallery/arcade area have artwork on the top, giving the outdoor covered walkway area an ornate appearance. The deep roof overhang, iron railing at the office elevation, exposed wood brackets, wall lamps, and the medallion add visual interest to the building design. Staff considers the proposed building design as attractive and well executed.

Signage

Non-illuminated signs would be installed on the walls at the entrance gate to the facility, and again on the building above the entrances to both the event center and the winery. The event center would be named as Casa Real, and the winery would take the historical name of Ruby Hill Winery. The signage would be made of steel frame with welded mesh backing. A condition has been added requiring sign details be submitted as part of the construction drawings, and are subject to the review and approval by the Planning Director prior to installation.

Landscaping

New landscaping would consist of olive trees, California pepper, crape myrtle, aristocrat pear, and ornamental plum species, with various shrubs, groundcover and annuals grouped in the driveway, parking areas, in the plaza and in the courtyard. The proposed landscaping would be drought tolerant, and would be irrigated with a drip/bubbler system.

Drainage

Proposed building grades would follow the site's existing topography. The applicant would grade the site to drain toward the vineyards. As such, the vineyards would receive all storm water runoff from the building and the parking areas. This approach has been reviewed and accepted by the Public Works/ Engineering Department.

Compliance with LEED

The LEED Green Building Rating System scorecard shows the proposed project would achieve 26 points, meeting LEED certified level.

Public Comment

As previously mentioned, the original design was rejected by the residents. Many of the nearby residents attended the first Homeowners Association meeting (July 24, 2006) and addressed their concerns of noise, lighting, parking, and view impact. Their comments concerning the original design are attached as Exhibit F as reference.

As a result of the first HOA meeting, a focal group was formed and it consisted of residents on East Ruby Hill Drive, Avio Court, Varese Court, and Santel Court. The focal group met on August 2, 2006. A consensus of supporting the project was reached if the site for the proposed building is relocated toward Vineyard Avenue and Isabel Avenue. Mr. Callahan revised the proposal, and a copy of which was given to Mrs. Carol Sum, the liaison of the focus group for review and comment.

As a follow-up, staff was contacted by Kerry Lamson, one of the focal group residents. Mr. Lamson indicated that the group continues to support the proposed development, however, concerns associated with traffic, noise from the event center as well as from wine product, dust and lighting from the parking area, etc. remain. Please refer to Exhibit G.

Notices of the Planning Commission's public hearing on this item were sent to property owners, business tenants, and homeowners within 1,000 feet of the subject property. Tom and Julie Lynch, 2301 East Ruby Hill Drive, oppose the proposal. Jimmy and Carol Waksdal, 535 Montori Court, oppose the proposal.

City of Livermore commented on the proposed development (Exhibit H). Its concerns were focused on: 1) the proposed development would be connected to the City of Livermore sewage system, and 2) impact on local traffic. The applicant has already contacted the City of Livermore in terms of sewer connection and fees. Condition of approval requires that the applicant pay required sewage fees to the City of Livermore.

As previously mentioned in the Site Design section, the proposed development would not affect the Route 84 Expressway Widening Project as the building footprint does not encroach further beyond the existing Piemonte Drive. In addition, traffic to and from the proposed event center would occur primarily at off-peak hours during mid-weekdays and weekend hours. The proposed

development would not worsen the existing LOS during peak hours. Further, staff has added a condition requiring staggered event schedules in order to reduce traffic congestion when there are events held at both the existing and the proposed facilities.

PUD DEVELOPMENT PLAN MAJOR MODIFICATION FINDINGS

The Zoning Ordinance of the Pleasanton Municipal Code sets forth the purposes of the Planned Unit Development (PUD) District and the considerations to be addressed in reviewing a PUD Development Plan and any major modification of an approved development plan. The Planning Commission must make the following findings that the proposed modification of the PUD-93-02 conforms to the purposes of the PUD District, before making its recommendation.

1. Whether the proposed development plan is in the best interests of the public health, safety, and general welfare:

The proposed project as designed and conditioned meets all applicable City standards concerning public health, safety, and welfare, e.g., vehicle access, geologic hazards (new development not within a special studies zone), and flood hazards. The proposed development plan is designed in conformance with the Pleasanton General Plan designations for this site and all other relevant policies and programs. The applicant will install a left-turn pocket and on Vineyard Avenue to facilitate efficient access to the site for westbound traffic and a decelerate lane on Vineyard Avenue. As proposed, there would be a total of 132 parking spaces provided in the parking areas surrounding the event center and winery building. Based on experience of operating a similar facility in the vicinity, the applicant believes that this number of parking is adequate to handle guests attending events.

Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

2. Whether the proposed development plan is consistent with the Pleasanton General Plan:

The subject property is designated by the Land Use Element of the Pleasanton General Plan for Agriculture and Grazing uses. The site is adjacent to the Vineyard Avenue Corridor Specific Plan area, and the General Plan for this area encourages uses which relate to the outlying wine country and calls for creating an attractive gateway to the Livermore Valley wine country and implementing wine country architectural and landscape design themes throughout the corridor. The Vineyard Avenue Corridor Specific Plan similarly contains land use objectives to encourage development of vineyard related commercial uses.

The existing farm buildings would be used for barrel and case storage use and wine production. The existing residence would be used as the caretaker for the vineyard. The proposed event center and winery would be complementary to the existing vineyards. Staff believes that it is appropriate for such facilities be located in wine-growing regions since people enjoy the vineyard setting for weddings, parties, and similar functions and since the facility would promote the area and attract tourism. This is consistent with one of the policies of the South Livermore Valley Area Plan, which encourages the promotion of the area as a premier wine-producing center by encouraging appropriate tourist attractions and supporting uses such as the proposed event center.

Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

3. Whether the proposed development plan is compatible with previously developed properties located in the vicinity of the plan:

Public street access to this site by the Vineyard Avenue Corridor Specific Plan would be from Vineyard Avenue. The proposed event center and winery is well separated from the existing homes in the Ruby Hill development. The proposed building would be designed to complement the architectural design of the existing commercial buildings in the vicinity.

Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

4. Whether the proposed development plan is compatible with the natural, topographic features of the site:

Minimal grading would be required to accommodate the proposed building and site improvements. The applicant would grade the site to drain towards the vineyard areas. In this manner, the vineyards would receive some storm water runoff from the buildings and parking areas.

Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

5. Whether grading in conjunction with the proposed development plan takes into account environmental characteristics and is designed in keeping with the best engineering practices to avoid erosion, slides, or flooding, and to have as minimal an effect upon the environment as possible.

Requirements of the Uniform Building Code – implemented by the City at the Building Permit review – would ensure that building foundations and parking/driveway areas are

constructed on satisfactorily compacted fill. Erosion control and dust suppression measures will be documented in the final subdivision map and will be administered by the City's Building and Public Works Departments. All construction activities are limited to the hours of 8:00 a.m. to 5:00 p.m., Monday through Friday. All construction equipment must meet Department of Motor Vehicles (DMV) noise standards and shall be equipped with muffling devices.

Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

6. Whether adequate public safety measures have been incorporated into the design of the proposed development plan:

The proposed building is required to be designed and constructed to meet the requirements of the Uniform Building Code, other applicable City codes, and State of California mandated noise, energy, and accessibility requirements. All streets meet City standards and are adequate to handle anticipated traffic volumes. Adequate access is provided to all structures for police, fire, and other emergency vehicles.

Through the design of the proposed development in conjunction with the recommended conditions of approval, staff believes that all public safety measures will be addressed. Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

7. Whether the proposed development plan conforms to the purposes of the PUD District:

The proposed modification to the original Ruby Hill development plan approval sets forth the parameters for the design and operation of the event center and winery in a manner consistent with the Pleasanton General Plan and with the surrounding area. The proposed development plan modification implements the purposes of the City's PUD Ordinance by providing uses consistent and supportive of the operations of the wine county. Through the proposed design augmented by the recommended conditions of approval, the project will substantially conform to the requirements for development specified in the Pleasanton General Plan.

Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT FINDINGS

The Planning Commission must make the following findings prior to granting the conditional use permit for the proposed event center:

1. The location of the proposed conditional use is in accordance with the objectives of the zoning ordinance and the purpose of the district in which the site is located.

The operation of the event center and winery would be considered complementary to the vineyards and wineries in the South Livermore Valley area. Its operation would be, in the opinion of staff, compatible with the winery and the homes of the Ruby Hill development to the southwest. Vineyards, wineries, and the uses complementary to a vineyard/winery are considered to be appropriate for the Agricultural zoning districts of the City.

Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

2. The proposed location of the conditional use and the conditions under which the conditional uses would be operated or maintained will not be detrimental to the public health, safety, or welfare, or materially injurious to the properties or improvements in the vicinity.

Vehicular access is provided from the newly aligned Vineyard Avenue, which would include a left-turn pocket for westbound traffic to the winery. There is adequate capacity to handle the anticipated traffic requirements for this facility. All events, performances, ceremonies, etc., taking place at the event center must conclude operation by 11:00 p.m. There is a general prohibition for outdoor music events/performances. However, weddings and similar ceremonies with an acoustic-only musical/voice accompaniment, and/or string quartet would be allowed to take place no later than 9:00 p.m. The proposed timing restrictions, with the acoustic-only provision, and the significant distances separating the inner courtyard from the closest homes would mitigate any negative impact to the homes in the Ruby Hill development.

Amplified musical events and performances would be limited to the interior areas of the event center. During the event, the doors and windows on the sides of the event center building facing the Ruby Hill development would be required to remain closed, but not locked, at all times. Additionally, adequate parking is provided for employees and visitors.

Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

3. The proposed conditional use will comply with each of the applicable provisions of this chapter.

The proposed conditional use is required to comply with all applicable sections of the Pleasanton Municipal Code and with PUD-93-02-8M, the PUD development plan and development plan modification governing the subject property. Conditions of approval for the operation of the event center and winery would ensure its compliance with the City's zoning ordinance and with the PUD. By complying with the recommended conditions of approval, the proposed facility would meet the criteria for receiving a conditional use permit and would, therefore, comply with the intent of the Pleasanton Municipal Code and the PUD development plan.

Therefore, staff believes that this finding can be made.

ENVIRONMENTAL ASSESSMENT

A negative declaration was prepared in conjunction with the proposed development. Based on the Initial Study and Negative Declaration, the project would not have a significant effect on the environment. The proposed project plans have been revised to avoid significant effects or mitigated by design to a point where the effects are insignificant and there is no substantial evidence that the project as revised may have a significant effect.

CONCLUSION

The proposed event center and winery would establish a compatible use and would meet the goals of the Pleasanton General Plan and the South Livermore Valley Area Plan. The overall design of the applicant's proposal carries many architectural features that are seen in wineries of the Napa/Sonoma area. The fountain and the entrance are the focal point, while the gallery, and the inner courtyard area create an attractive, pedestrian-oriented space. The views of the facility from Vineyard Avenue and Isabel Avenue would reinforce the wine-making heritage of the Ruby Hill area and, additionally, would work well with the nearby Ruby Hill development. As proposed and conditioned, the project would be compatible with the existing homes of the Ruby Hill development.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends the Planning Commission recommend approval of Case PUD-93-02-8M and Case PCUP-181 to the City Council by taking the following actions:

1. Find that the project will not have a significant effect on the environment, and adopt the resolution approving the Negative Declaration as shown in Exhibit I, and Find that the project has a De Minimis impact on the site's wildlife;.

2. Find that the proposed major modification to the PUD Development Plan is consistent with the General Plan and the purposes of the PUD Ordinance, and make the findings as identified in the staff report; and,
3. Make the Conditional Use Permit findings as stated in the staff report and recommend approval of PCUP-181 subject to Exhibit “B”, Draft Conditions of Approval.

Staff Planner: Jenny Soo: 925.931.5615 or email: jsoo@ci.pleasanton.ca.us